

Efficacy of Clodinafop, Fenoxaprop, Sulfosulfuron and Triasulfuron Alone and as Tank Mixture Against Weeds in Wheat

R. S. Malik, Ashok Yadav, R. K. Malik and Sher Singh

Department of Agronomy

CCS Haryana Agricultural University, Hisar-125 004 (Haryana) India

ABSTRACT

Clodinafop at 50 and 60 g ha⁻¹ and fenoxaprop at 100 and 120 g ha⁻¹ were very effective (85-90%) against grassy weeds but totally ineffective against broadleaf weeds in wheat. Triasulfuron at 20 to 25 g ha⁻¹ was not at all effective against grassy weeds but highly effective (80-93%) against broadleaf weeds. Sulfosulfuron at 20 to 25 g ha⁻¹ provided 79-84% control of grassy weeds and 21-47% control of broadleaf weeds. Tank mixture of triasulfuron at 25 g ha⁻¹ with clodinafop at 50 g ha⁻¹, fenoxaprop at 100 g ha⁻¹ or sulfosulfuron at 20 g ha⁻¹ proved very effective (76-87%) against both grasses and non-grasses in wheat.

INTRODUCTION

In large part of north-west India, grassy weeds (*Phalaris minor* and *Avena ludoviciana*) together with many broadleaf weeds infest wheat crop causing huge yield losses (Malik *et al.*, 1992; Balyan, 2001; Singh and Singh, 2002). Tank mixture of isoproturon with 2, 4-D (Balyan and Malik, 1988) or with metsulfuron (Yadav *et al.*, 2000) was found successful against complex weed flora in the past especially in the situation where isoproturon was effective against *P. minor*. But to manage complex weed flora dominated by either *A. ludoviciana* or isoproturon resistant *P. minor*, suitable combination of clodinafop, fenoxaprop or sulfosulfuron with some broad-spectrum herbicide is needed because under such situations isoproturon based combinations do not work satisfactorily. Metsulfuron-methyl or 2, 4-D when tank mixed with clodinafop, fenoxaprop or sulfosulfuron results in poor efficacy against grassy weeds due to antagonistic effects (Yadav *et al.*, 2002). Hence, present investigation was planned to evaluate the efficacy of clodinafop, fenoxaprop, sulfosulfuron and triasulfuron alone and in combination against complex weed flora in wheat.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

A field experiment was conducted at Research

Farm of CCS Haryana Agricultural University, Hisar, India during winter season of 2002-03 and 2003-04. The soil of the experimental field was sandy loam in texture, medium in fertility and slightly alkaline in reaction (pH 8.2). Wheat variety PBW 343 using seed rate of 35 kg ha⁻¹ was sown under furrow irrigated raised bed system (FIRBS) on November 12 in 2002-03 and November 23 in 2003-04 keeping two rows on the top of beds. The crop was raised with all other recommended package of practices. The experiment consisted various doses of clodinafop, sulfosulfuron and fenoxaprop each alone and in combination with triasulfuron at 20 g ha⁻¹, triasulfuron alone at 20 and 25 g ha⁻¹, weedy and weed-free check (Table 1). The experiment was laid out in randomized block design replicated thrice. All the herbicides were applied 35 days after sowing (DAS) using knapsack sprayer fitted with flat fan nozzle using 650 l of water per hectare.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The field was infested with complex weed flora comprising both grassy (70% in 2002-03 and 85% in 2003-04) as well as broadleaf weeds (30% in 2002-03 and 15% in 2003-04). Among grassy weeds, *A. ludoviciana* was the major weed (90%) along with *P. minor* (10%). Whereas broadleaf weeds comprised mainly *C. album* (50%), *R. retroflexus*

Table 1. Population/density and dry weight of weeds as affected by herbicide treatments

| Herbicide | Dose (g ha ⁻¹) | Population of weeds (No. m ⁻²) | | Dry weight of weeds (g m ⁻²) | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------|--|-----------------|--|-----------------|--------------|-----------------|--------------|-----------------|---------|---------|------|------|
| | | 90 DAS | | 60 DAS | | 90 DAS | | 90 DAS | | | | | |
| | | Grassy weeds | Broadleaf weeds | Grassy weeds | Broadleaf weeds | Grassy weeds | Broadleaf weeds | Grassy weeds | Broadleaf weeds | | | | |
| | | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | | |
| Clodinafop | 50 | 16 | 23 | 44 | 32 | 15.4 | 19.4 | 32.0 | 26.8 | 41.3 | 59.2 | 48.9 | 34.8 |
| Clodinafop | 60 | 6 | 10 | 45 | 36 | 10.1 | 14.9 | 30.9 | 25.9 | 22.6 | 35.5 | 51.4 | 36.1 |
| Sulfosulfuron | 20 | 21 | 32 | 30 | 19 | 24.0 | 33.7 | 23.1 | 15.0 | 64.1 | 92.0 | 38.7 | 26.7 |
| Sulfosulfuron | 25 | 15 | 25 | 26 | 14 | 14.1 | 22.1 | 21.4 | 10.8 | 47.6 | 78.7 | 33.8 | 17.8 |
| Fenoxaprop | 100 | 14 | 21 | 45 | 38 | 17.0 | 24.9 | 31.2 | 26.9 | 44.2 | 66.2 | 50.6 | 51.0 |
| Fenoxaprop | 120 | 4 | 8 | 44 | 34 | 9.7 | 17.8 | 29.5 | 24.7 | 23.7 | 43.8 | 49.8 | 34.2 |
| Triasulfuron | 20 | 105 | 177 | 4 | 6 | 82.1 | 128.6 | 3.7 | 5.8 | 312.4 | 464.7 | 6.5 | 6.6 |
| Triasulfuron | 25 | 108 | 175 | 1 | 2 | 84.8 | 134.3 | 1.3 | 3.1 | 306.3 | 459.2 | 3.4 | 4.2 |
| Clodinafop+Triasulfuron | 50+20 | 14 | 21 | 8 | 4 | 21.1 | 29.9 | 5.2 | 2.9 | 49.7 | 71.9 | 7.2 | 5.2 |
| Clodinafop+Triasulfuron | 60+20 | 7 | 12 | 7 | 4 | 13.3 | 21.4 | 4.5 | 2.5 | 21.7 | 36.8 | 7.9 | 4.7 |
| Sulfosulfuron+Triasulfuron | 20+20 | 24 | 36 | 5 | 2 | 23.5 | 31.9 | 4.7 | 1.9 | 71.6 | 98.4 | 6.3 | 5.2 |
| Sulfosulfuron+Triasulfuron | 25+20 | 14 | 22 | 3 | 1 | 11.9 | 18.1 | 3.8 | 1.7 | 49.7 | 76.0 | 6.2 | 3.4 |
| Fenoxaprop+Sulfosulfuron | 100+20 | 8 | 11 | 32 | 22 | 20.7 | 26.6 | 23.7 | 17.0 | 43.6 | 57.8 | 40.7 | 25.4 |
| Fenoxaprop+Sulfosulfuron | 120+20 | 4 | 4 | 28 | 21 | 13.3 | 14.5 | 21.8 | 15.9 | 21.8 | 24.6 | 41.9 | 30.0 |
| Weedy | - | 104 | 173 | 43 | 31 | 81.8 | 128.3 | 29.2 | 24.0 | 302.6 | 457.8 | 48.8 | 33.9 |
| Weed-free | - | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| LSD (P=0.05) | | 5.8 | 7.4 | 5.9 | 4.7 | 3.3 | 4.7 | 2.8 | 4.4 | 6.6 | 15.3 | 3.0 | 3.6 |

(10%), *C. didymus* (20%), *M. alba* (10%) and miscellaneous weeds (10%).

Effect on Weeds

The density of grassy weeds at 90 DAS (Table 1) was significantly reduced by clodinafop (50 and 60 g ha⁻¹), fenoxaprop (100 and 120 g ha⁻¹), sulfosulfuron (20 and 25 g ha⁻¹) alone or in combination with triasulfuron at 20 g ha⁻¹. Clodinafop and fenoxaprop were ineffective against broadleaf weeds but sulfosulfuron provided 21-47% control of broadleaf weeds. Triasulfuron being very effective against broadleaf weeds (80-93%) was ineffective against grassy weeds. Similar effect was observed in terms of dry weight accumulation by weeds at 60 and 90 DAS. Combination of triasulfuron at 20 g ha⁻¹ with clodinafop at 50 g ha⁻¹, fenoxaprop at 100 g ha⁻¹ or sulfosulfuron at 20 g ha⁻¹ proved very effective (76-87%) against complex flora of weeds during both the years. Efficacy of aforesaid tank mixtures was also almost similar when higher dose of clodinafop (60 g ha⁻¹), fenoxaprop (120 g ha⁻¹) or sulfosulfuron (25 g ha⁻¹) was tank mixed with triasulfuron. Antagonistic effect of triasulfuron on the efficacy of clodinafop

against weeds has already been reported (Yadav *et al.*, 2002). Since the weed flora under present experimentation was pre-dominated by *A. ludoviciana*, the expected antagonistic effect might have not been reflected because *A. ludoviciana* can be controlled with 20-25% less dose of any of these herbicides compared to *P. minor*.

Effect on Crop

All the herbicidal treatments resulted in significantly higher number of spikes and grain yield of wheat (Table 2). The maximum number of spikes and grain yield of wheat (5028 and 4989 kg ha⁻¹) were recorded in the plots kept weed-free throughout the crop season. However, it was at par with tank mix application of triasulfuron at 20 g ha⁻¹ with clodinafop at 60 g ha⁻¹, fenoxaprop at 120 g ha⁻¹ or sulfosulfuron at 25 g ha⁻¹ during both the years and sulfosulfuron alone at 25 g ha⁻¹ during 2002-03 only. Clodinafop, fenoxaprop and triasulfuron applied alone resulted in lower grain yield of wheat compared to their tank mix application and also statistically inferior to weed-free check. This could be due to poor control of complex weed flora by these herbicides. Weeds growing throughout the crop

Table 2. Weed control efficiency and grain yield of wheat as influenced by herbicide treatments

| Herbicide | Dose (g ha ⁻¹) | Weed control efficiency at 90 DAS | | | | Spikes | | Grain yield | |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---------|-----------------|---------|------------------------|---------|------------------------|---------|
| | | Grassy weeds | | Broadleaf weeds | | (No. m ⁻²) | | (kg ha ⁻¹) | |
| | | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 | 2002-03 | 2003-04 |
| Clodinafop | 50 | 86 | 87 | 0 | 0 | 360 | 351 | 4518 | 4444 |
| Clodinafop | 60 | 92 | 92 | 0 | 0 | 366 | 354 | 4634 | 4592 |
| Sulfosulfuron | 20 | 79 | 80 | 21 | 21 | 351 | 342 | 4529 | 4387 |
| Sulfosulfuron | 25 | 84 | 83 | 32 | 47 | 372 | 351 | 4696 | 4563 |
| Fenoxaprop | 100 | 85 | 85 | 0 | 0 | 357 | 348 | 4498 | 4416 |
| Fenoxaprop | 120 | 92 | 90 | 0 | 0 | 360 | 354 | 4533 | 4659 |
| Triasulfuron | 20 | 0 | 0 | 88 | 80 | 348 | 333 | 3891 | 3240 |
| Triasulfuron | 25 | 0 | 0 | 93 | 88 | 354 | 342 | 4244 | 3706 |
| Clodinafop+Triasulfuron | 50+20 | 84 | 84 | 85 | 85 | 369 | 357 | 4799 | 4704 |
| Clodinafop+Triasulfuron | 60+20 | 93 | 92 | 84 | 86 | 375 | 366 | 4881 | 4842 |
| Sulfosulfuron+Triasulfuron | 20+20 | 76 | 78 | 87 | 85 | 360 | 363 | 4633 | 4498 |
| Sulfosulfuron+Triasulfuron | 25+20 | 84 | 83 | 87 | 90 | 372 | 360 | 4853 | 4752 |
| Fenoxaprop+Sulfosulfuron | 100+20 | 86 | 87 | 17 | 25 | 357 | 348 | 4481 | 4589 |
| Fenoxaprop+Sulfosulfuron | 120+20 | 93 | 95 | 14 | 11 | 369 | 357 | 4639 | 4797 |
| Weedy | - | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 297 | 288 | 2892 | 2469 |
| Weed-free | - | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 384 | 372 | 5028 | 4989 |
| LSD (P=0.05) | | | | | | 16 | 14 | 361 | 289 |

season reduced the grain yield of wheat to the extent of 42.5 and 50.5% during 2002-03 and 2003-04, respectively. Performance of these herbicidal mixtures also needs to be examined against complex flora of weeds pre-dominated by *P. minor* in wheat.

REFERENCES

- Balyan, R. S. 2001. Evaluation of new herbicides against mixed weed flora in wheat. *Haryana J. Agron.* **17** : 30-34.
- Balyan, R. S. and R. K. Malik, 1988. Effect of time of application of isoproturon+2, 4-D on the control of weeds in wheat. *Haryana agric. Univ. J. Res.* **18** : 47-49.
- Malik, R. K., R. S. Panwar and R. S. Malik, 1992. Chemical control of broadleaf and grassy weeds in wheat (*Triticum aestivum*). *Indian J. Agron.* **37** : 324-326.
- Singh, G. and M. Singh, 2002. Bio-efficacy of metsulfuron-methyl in combination with isoproturon for control of grassy and non-grassy weeds in wheat. *Indian J. Weed Sci.* **34** : 9-12.
- Yadav, A., R. K. Malik, B. S. Chauhan and G. Gill, 2002. Present status of herbicide resistance in Haryana. In : Proc. International Workshop on Herbicide Resistance Management and Zero-Tillage in Rice-Wheat Cropping System, March 4-6 held at CCS Haryana Agricultural University, Hisar, India. pp. 15-22.
- Yadav, D. B., A. Yadav, S. Singh and R. K. Malik, 2000. Probit equations, GR_{50} values and degradation rate of metsulfuron-methyl as influenced by temperature and its weed control efficacy. *Haryana J. Agron.* **16** : 86-89.